Arrival Time Prediction

Brandon Houghton, Kenji Yonekawa
08-537 - Fei Fang
Background

The bus just left..
The bus should’ve been here 10 minutes ago..
I’m cold - how much longer should I wait?
Motivation

- High demand for bus arrival prediction
  - + 25,000 installs in Pittsburgh alone
  - Consistent daily usage
- Inefficiency of bus routes
- Lots of available data
Motivation

- High demand for bus arrival prediction
- Inefficiency of bus routes
  - Higher Utilization drives efficiency
  - Real-Time tracking can inform route changes
  - Delay cited as number one deterrent
  - Missing bus due to inaccurate real time info was number three
- Lots of available data
Motivation

- High demand for bus arrival prediction
- Inefficiency of bus routes
- Lots of available data
  - GPS Bus location tracking
  - Passengers track stops within app
  - Real-time traffic estimation
  - Weather, Events, etc.
Related Work

- Multiple studies done
  - W. Treethidtaphat, W. Pattara-Atikom, and S. Khaimook, "Bus Arrival Time Prediction at Any Distance of Bus Route Using Deep Neural Network Model", 2017
  - P. Zhou and Y. Zheng and M. Li, "How Long to Wait? Predicting Bus Arrival Time With Mobile Phone Based Participatory Sensing", 2014

- Problems
  - Often use erroneous location tracking
  - Based on a couple of days of data collection
  - Different setting used (location, time, data)
Data Set

- PAT TrueTime API
  - GPS of bus location
  - Updates every 10 seconds
  - Arrival Estimates

- Weather API
  - Precipitation, temperature, wind
  - Updates every hour

Stored in GCP
Evaluation

- Limited Horizon
  - Riders not interested in accuracy after 15 minutes
  - Buses can change routes

- Mean Absolute Percentage Error
  - Most common
  - Easy to compare

\[
\text{MAPE} = \frac{\sum_{t=1}^{n} \left| \frac{A_t - F_t}{A_t} \right|}{n}
\]
Evaluation

- Previous approaches don’t generalize well
- Pittsburgh is much more diverse

Wall et. al.

MAPE: 12%

MAPE: 36.9%
Use Velocity Instead of Time

- Errors do not accumulate
- Velocity
Qualitative Results

- Linear Model
  - Highly dependent on number of bins
- Tree Based Model
  - Does not generalize well to new month of data
- Mixture Models
  - Feature selection was overfitting validation set
PAT Model
Model Refinement - Tree Segmentation
Model Refinement - Linear Interpolation
Model Refinement - External Observations

Weekday

Weekend

Speed

Evaluation Setup

- Results on one Route (61C) that had the most data.
- Train data: March 2018: 155,398 data points
- Test Data: April 2018: 101,504 data points
- True label: future data acquired from PAT’s API
## Evaluation Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Model name</th>
<th>Mean Absolute Percentage Error (MAPE)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Linear model</td>
<td>28.48%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Piecewise linear model</td>
<td>23.84%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Decision tree linear model</td>
<td>22.70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Piecewise linear mixture model</td>
<td>18.53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Decision tree with linear mixture model</td>
<td>15.60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Piecewise linear model with momentum</td>
<td>12.25%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

PAT’s prediction model

Largely affected by historic data. (slope, intercept becomes negative)
Haven’t figured out optimal prediction model
Future Work

- Add other data to aid prediction
  - Traffic data from Google’s Real Time Traffic
  - Class schedule for local colleges
  - Holidays and Events

- Provide our contribution as an API or incorporate with smartphone applications
  - Allow applications to integrate improved data without changing apps
Summary

- We tackled the societal challenge of predicting bus arrival time
- Evaluated existing research approaches
- Benchmarked existing API
- Developed and evaluated new approach
- New approach outperforms existing API
Thanks for listening!
Reference

---

Photo Credits:


W. Treethidtaphat, W. Pattara-Atikom, and S. Khaimook, "Bus Arrival Time Prediction at Any Distance of Bus Route Using Deep Neural Network Model", 2017


P. Zhou and Y. Zheng and M. Li, "How Long to Wait? Predicting Bus Arrival Time With Mobile Phone Based Participatory Sensing", 2014