

## Core seminar II (80-602)

Spring 2012

*Time:* Tuesdays, 3:00-5:50

*Place:* Baker Hall 150

*Instructor:* Jeremy Avigad

*e-mail:* avigad@cmu.edu

*office:* Baker Hall 161D

*office hours:* by appointment

All readings will be posted on Blackboard: <http://www.cmu.edu/blackboard>

### *Requirements:*

- Synopses: 30%
- Participation and presentation of papers: 30%
- Paper (draft + final): 40%

For each paper assigned, I would like you to prepare a roughly one-page synopsis, and turn it in *before* we discuss the paper in class. Simply summarize the main argument and present it as charitably as you can, and point out any weaknesses or shortcomings you perceive.

In addition, we will all take turns leading the discussion of the papers. Responsibility for each paper will be doled on more or less at random in the first seminar. For those papers you are assigned, you should prepare a detailed outline and use that to structure the classroom discussion.

Finally, I would like you to write a 10-15 page paper (single-spaced) on a topic of your choosing, generally related to any of the topics treated in this seminar or any of the central topics of interest in the department. This is due on the last day of class. It should respond to or address issues raised in the recent philosophical literature, say, within the last decade or so. Do not recycle or revise a paper you have written in the past; do something new.

Please turn in a rough, partial, preliminary version of the paper part way through the semester, so I can provide feedback. Only the final version will count towards your grade. I will nominally set a deadline of Friday, March 23 for this, but that is not a hard deadline. Keep in mind, however, that I cannot promise an immediate turnaround, so the earlier you turn in the draft the more likely it is that my feedback will be helpful.

## Language

January 24: Sense and reference

- Frege, Gottlob, "On Sense and Reference." *Zeitschrift für Philosophie und philosophische Kritik*, 100:25-50, 1892. Translated by M. Black, 1952. Reprinted in A. W. Moore, ed., *Meaning and Reference*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1993, pp. 23-42.
- Russell, Bertrand, "On Denoting." *Mind*, 14 (56): 479-493, 1905.
- Strawson, P. F., "On Referring." *Mind*, 59 (235): 320-344, 1950.

January 31: Meaning and the empirical sciences

- Lewis, C. I., "Experience and Meaning." *Philosophical Review*, 43 (2): 125-146, 1934.
- Schlick, Moritz, "Meaning and Verification." *Philosophical Review*, 45 (4): 339-369, 1936
- Quine, W. V., "Two Dogmas of Empiricism." *Philosophical Review*, 60 (1): 20-43, 1951.

February 7: Meaning and truth

- Tarski, Alfred, "The Semantic Conception of Truth and the Foundations of Semantics." *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research*, 4 (3): 341-376, 1944.
- Davidson, Donald, "Truth and Meaning," *Synthese*, 17: 304-323, 1967.
- Strawson, P. F., excerpt from *Meaning and Truth*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1970.  
Reprinted in A. P. Martinich, ed., *The Philosophy of Language* (third edition), New York: Oxford University Press, 1996, pp. 104-115.
- Grice, H. P., "Meaning." *Philosophical Review*, 66(3):377-388, 1971.

February 14: Propositional attitudes and referential opacity

- Quine, W. V., "Quantifiers and Propositional Attitudes." *Journal of Philosophy*, 53 (5):177-187, 1956.
- Donald Davidson, "On Saying That." *Synthese*, 19:130-146, 1968.
- Kripke, Saul, "Identity and necessity." In Milton K. Munitz, ed., *Identity and Individuation*, NYU Press, 1971, pp. 135-64.

## Metaphysics

February 21: Universals

- Russell, Bertrand, "On the Relations of Universals and Particulars." *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society*, 12:1-24, 1912. Reprinted in Bertrand Russell, *Logic and Knowledge*, London: Allen and Unwin, 1956, pp. 105-124.
- Quine, W.V., "On What there is." *Review of Metaphysics*, 2 (5): 21-38, 1948.
- Armstrong, David, excerpts from *Universals*. Westview Press, 1989, pages 75-112. Reprinted in Michael J. Loux, editor, *Metaphysics: Contemporary Readings*, New York: Routledge, 2008, pp. 65-91.

February 28: Modalities and possible worlds

Lewis, David, "Possible Worlds." In *On the Plurality of Worlds*, Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 1986, pp. 192-209.

Plantinga, Alvin, "Actualism and Possible Worlds." *Theoria*, 42: 139–60, 1973.

Lewis, David, "Counterparts or Double Lives?" In *Counterfactuals*, Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 1973, pp. 84-91.

### Mathematics and abstract objects

March 6: Nature of mathematics

Carnap, Rudolf, Arendt Heyting, and John von Neumann, "Symposium on the Foundations of Mathematics." "Symposium on the Foundations of Mathematics." *Erkenntnis*, 2 (1): 91-121, 1931. Reprinted in P. Benacerraf & H. Putnam (eds.), *Philosophy of Mathematics* (second edition), Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983, pp. 41-65.

Benacerraf, Paul, "What Numbers Could not Be." *Philosophical Review*, 74: 47-73, 1965.

Benacerraf, Paul, "Mathematical Truth." *Journal of Philosophy*, 70 (19): 661-679, 1973

Putnam, Hilary, "What is Mathematical Truth?" *Historia Mathematica* 2 (1975): 529-543.

Reprinted in *Mathematics, Matter and Method. Philosophical Papers, vol. 1.*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1975, pp. 60-78.

March 20: Abstract entities in science and mathematics

Hempel, Carl G., "The Theoretician's Dilemma: A Study in the Logic of Theory Construction." In H. Feigl, M. Scriven, & G. Maxwell (eds.), *Minnesota Studies in the Philosophy of Science, vol. II*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1958. Reprinted in his *Aspects of Scientific Explanation and Other Essays in the Philosophy of Science*, New York: Free Press, 1960, pp. 173-226.

Carnap, Rudolf, "Empiricism, Semantics, and Ontology." *Revue Internationale de Philosophie*, 4: 20-40, 1950. Reprinted in Rudolf Carnap, *Meaning and Necessity: A Study in Semantics and Modal Logic* (second edition), Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1956, pp. 205-221.

Burgess, John, "Quine, Analyticity, and the Philosophy of Mathematics." *Philosophical Quarterly*, 54:38-55, 2004. Reprinted in John Burgess, *Mathematics, Models, and Modality: Selected Philosophical Essays*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008, pp. 66-84.

March 27: Methodology of mathematics

Steiner, Mark, "Mathematical Explanation." *Philosophical Studies*, 34: 135-151, 1978.

Wilson, Mark, "Frege: The Royal Road from Geometry." *Noûs*, 26 (2):149-180, 1992.

Avigad, Jeremy, "Understanding Proofs." In Paolo Mancosu, editor, *The Philosophy of Mathematical Practice*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008, pp. 317-353.

## Computation and Mind

*April 3:* Computability, and the computational view of mind

- Turing, Alan, "On Computable Numbers, with an Application to the Entscheidungsproblem." *Proceedings of the London Mathematical Society*, 42, 1936. Reprinted in B. J. Copeland, ed., *The Essential Turing*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004, pp. 58-87.
- Turing, Alan, "Intelligent Machinery." National Physical Laboratory report, 1948. Reprinted in *The Essential Turing*, pp. 410-432.
- Block, Ned, and Jerry Fodor, "What Psychological States Are Not." *Philosophical Review*, 81: 159-181, 1972.

*April 10:* Functionalism

- Putnam, Hilary, "Psychological Predicates," in W. H. Capitan and D. D. Merrill, eds., *Art, Mind, and Religion*, University of Pittsburgh Press, 1973, pp. 37-38. Reprinted as "The Nature of Mental States," in David Chalmers, ed., *Philosophy of Mind: Classical and Contemporary Readings*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2002, pp. 73-79.
- Lewis, David, "Psychological and Theoretical Identifications." *Australasian Journal of Philosophy*, 50(3): 249-258, 1972.
- Nagel, Thomas, "What is it Like to be a Bat?" *The Philosophical Review*, 83(4): 435-450, 1974.

*April 17:* Propositional attitudes

- Fodor, Jerry, "Propositional Attitudes." *The Monist*, 61: 573-91, 1978. Reprinted in Chalmers, pp. 542-555.
- Denet, Daniel, "True believers: the Intensional Strategy and Why It Works." In Heath, A. F., ed., *Scientific Explanations*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1981. Reprinted in Chalmers, pp. 556-568.
- Churchland, Paul, "Eliminative Materialism and the Propositional Attitudes." *Journal of Philosophy*, 78 (2): 67-90, 1981

## Ethics and political philosophy

*April 24:* Utilitarianism

- Harsanyi, John, "Morality and the Theory of Rational Behavior." *Social Research*, 44: 623-656, 1977.
- Sen, Amartya, "Utilitarianism and Welfarism." *Journal of Philosophy*, 76 (9): 463-489, 1979
- Levi, Isaac, excerpts from *Hard Choices*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986, pp. 1-16.

*May 1:* Rawls, egalitarianism, and prioritarianism

- Rawls, John, "Justice as Rational Choice Behind a Veil of Ignorance." Excerpts from *A Theory of Justice*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1971. Reprinted in J. P. Sterba (ed.),

1980. *Justice: Alternative Political Perspectives* (pp. 49-67). Belmont, CA: Wadsworth.

Parfit, Derek, "Equality or Priority?" 1995. Reprinted in M. Clayton & A. Williams, eds., *The Ideal of Equality*, Basingstoke: Palgrave MacMillan, 2002, pp. 81-125.

Waldron, Jeremy, "John Rawls and the Social Minimum." *Journal of Applied Philosophy*, 3 (1): 21-33, 1986.